

To: Ken Newcombe, Fund Manager, Prototype Carbon Fund
CC: Ian Johnson, VP, ESSD, World Bank
Executive Directors, World Bank

Dear Mr Newcombe,

21/07/2003

We, social movements, Churches, trade unions, local communities and citizens, signed two letters that were sent to the Prototype Carbon Fund – the PCF – (26 March and 23 May 2003), presenting criticism to the Project that was submitted to this fund by the Brazilian company Plantar S/A.

We are writing once again to demand an apology from you as the PCF Fund Manager for repeating a false allegation made by Plantar in its response on 11 April 2003 to the 26 March 2003 letter of 53 Brazilian civil society organizations to the PCF.

The specific allegation is that we had included the Rural Trade Union of São Mateus/ES (Sindicato Rural de São Mateus/ES) on our first letter without their knowledge. This allegation, which we consider very serious because it characterizes crime of ideological falsehood, made us appear as suspicious and has tarnished our reputation in general. In reality, who signed the letter with us was the Trade Union of Rural Workers of São Mateus/ES (Sindicato dos Trabalhadores Rurais de São Mateus/ES). Active in the municipalities of São Mateus and Jaguaré/ES, this is one of the organizations that has been most involved in the struggle against the large-scale tree monocultures in Espírito Santo.

It is sad to notice that the World Bank, with its vast experience, was not able to check information by means of a simple comparison of the names, to verify that who was acting in bad faith was the Plantar company.

Nevertheless, we reaffirm that the trade union that Plantar cited was never listed as a signatory on our letter. We do not have any doubts that Plantar, as a Brazilian company, is able to make this distinction between the two types of trade unions. This shows a deliberate attempt to confuse and weaken our struggle. Besides this, we note that in our second letter, dated 26 May 2003, responding to Plantar, the Rural Workers Union of São Mateus/ES (Sindicato dos Trabalhadores Rurais de São Mateus/ES) has again signed on and has provided an email address so that they can be contacted to confirm their endorsement.

We have been informed that you as director of the PCF have been repeating this false allegation in public fora, such as at a conference in Brussels in May of this year. We are deeply disturbed about this. We consider it unacceptable for a senior staff member of the World Bank to resort to such tactics when faced with community opposition to a PCF project.

Please note that your repetition of this falsehood means that the World Bank is unfairly tarnishing the reputation of over 50 Brazilian NGOs, church groups, social movements, unions and individuals, representing together thousands of people. This will seriously impact your credibility as a Bank in this country if left uncorrected. We should also

inform you that we have had the opportunity to personally correct this issue with individual PCF investors, who were distinctly unimpressed at being misled.

We believe an apology is due for your dissemination of this false allegation put forth in the Plantar letter, as well as a clarifying note to participants of the public meetings where these claims about questionable signatures were made, and that it be posted on your website.

Given the gravity of this issue we must insist upon an immediate written response. Hereby follow the e-mails of all that sign this letter,

Sincerely,

Name/e-mails

- 1- ACPO - Associação de Combate aos POPs (Association of Combat to POPs/Brazil) - jeffer@acpo.org.br
- 2- ACPO - Associação de Consciência à Prevenção Ocupacional (Association of Conscience on Occupational Prevention/Brazil) - acpo94@uol.com.br
- 3- AGB-BH - Associação dos Geógrafos Brasileiros Seção Local de Belo Horizonte (Brazilian Association of Geographers – Belo Horizonte’s dept./Minas Gerais/ Brazil) - agb-bh@bol.com.br
- 4- AGB-ES - Associação dos Geógrafos Brasileiros - Seção Vitória (Brazilian Association of Geographers - Vitória/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - pscarim@hotmail.com
- 5- AGB-RJ - Associação dos Geógrafos Brasileiros - Seção Rio de Janeiro (Brazilian Association of Geographers – Rio de Janeiro/Brazil) - agbrio@bol.com.br
- 6- APEDEMA (environmental association/Rio de Janeiro/Brazil) - executiva@apedema.org
- 7- Artur de Souza Moret - Forum de debate sobre energia de Rondônia (Debate Forum on energy from Rondônia/Rondônia/Brazil) - arturmoret@ig.com.br
- 8- Associação de Mulheres Unidas da Serra (Women’s United Association/Serra/Espírito Santo/Brazil)- cddh@terra.com.br
- 9- Bicuda Ecológica (environmental organization/Rio de Janeiro/Brazil) bicuda@bicuda.org.br
- 10- CAA – Centro de Agricultura Alternativa - CAA - Centro de Agricultura Alternativa (Centre for Alternative Agriculture/Minas Gerais/Brazil) - caa_nm@connect.com.br
- 11- CADH – Centro de Apoio aos Direitos Humanos (Centre for Support of Human Rights/Vitória/Espírito Santo/Brazil) – dhumanos@uol.com.br
- 12- Campo Vale - Centro de Assessoria aos Movimentos Populares do Vale do Jequitinhonha (Minas Novas/MG) (Support centre for Popular Movements of the Jequitinhonha Valley/Minas Gerais/Brazil) - campo@uai.com.br
- 13- Cáritas Diocesana de São Mateus (Cáritas of the Diocese of São Mateus/Espírito Santo/Brazil) secrsama@samanet.com.br
- 14- Carlos Casteglione – Deputado Estadual do PT/ES - (State Member of Parliament/ Espírito Santo/Brazil) - carloscasteglione@al.es.gov.br
- 15- Carlos Lobo – Direção Estadual do PT/ES (Member of State Directroy of Workers Party/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - lobopt@hotmail.com
- 16- CDDH-Serra - Marta Falqueto (Centre for Defence of Human Rights/Serra/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - cddh@terra.com.br
- 17- CEDEFES - Centro de Documentação Eloy Ferreira da Silva (Documentation Centre Eloy Ferreira da Silva/Minas Gerais/Brazil) – cedefes@cedefes.org.br
- 18- Centro de Direitos Humanos de Teixeira de Freitas (Human Rights Centre of Teixeira de Freitas/Bahia/Brazil) - pejose@uol.com.br
- 19- CEPEDES - Centro de Pesquisa P/Desenvolvimento do Extr. Sul da Bahia (Research and Development Centre of the Extreme South of Bahia/ Bahia/ Brazil) - cepedes@vnet.com.br
- 20- CESESb - Centro de Ensino Superior/Sul da Bahia (Centre for Superior Education/ Bahia/Brazil)- cesesb@dstech.com.br
- 21- CIMI Equipe ES - Conselho Indigenista Missionário (Indigenist Missionary Council - Espírito Santo/Brazil) - cimies@terra.com.br
- 22- Cláudio Vereza – Deputado Estadual – PT/ES – (State Member of Parliament/ Espírito Santo/Brazil) - claudiovereza@al.es.gov.br
- 23- Coopesca - Rosa Maria Nascimento Miranda - Cooperativa de Pesca de Jacaraípe (Fisherpeople cooperative of Jacaraípe/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - cddh@terra.com.br
- 24- CUT-ES/ Central Única dos Trabalhadores do Espírito Santo (Federation of Trade Unions in Espírito Santo/Brazil) - secgeral@cut-es.org.br
- 25- CUT-Extremo Sul da Bahia - Central Única dos Trabalhadores/Ext. Sul Bahia (Federation of TradeUnions in Extreme South of Bahia/Brazil)- sindextrsul@dstech.com.br
- 26- CUT-RJ/ Central Única dos Trabalhadores do Rio de Janeiro (Federation of Trade Unions in Rio de Janeiro/Brazil) – cutrj@cut.org.br
- 27- Daniel Ribeiro Silvestre - drsilvestre@uol.com.br
- 28- Dr. Klemens Laschefski – Modevida - Movimento em defesa da vida - Klemens Laschefski - representante Modevida: Movimento em Defesa da Vida (representative Movement in Defence of Life/Minas Gerais/Brazil) = klemens.laschefski@gmx.nest
- 29- Eduardo de Biase - Vereador PT/São Mateus (town-councillor São Mateus/Espírito Santo/Brazil) cmsmes@escelsanet.com.br

- 30- Educafro - Maria da Penha Gaspar Pereira - Pré-vestibular alternativo de Carapina (alternative education course of Carapina/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - cddh@terra.com.br
- 31- Escola Família Agrícola de Jaguaré - responsável Madalena Tonieri (Family School for Agriculture Jaguaré/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - tel. +55 27 37691345
- 32- Escola Família Agrícola de Nestor Gomes - responsável João Rodrigues Pinto (Family School for Agriculture Nestor Gomes/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - tel. +55 27 37630027
- 33- Espaço Cultural da Paz (Cultural Peace Centre/Bahia/Brazil) - Rua da Paz,73/São Lourenço/Teixeira de Freitas(BA)
- 34- Evanete Negris - Vereador PSB/São Mateus (town-councillor São Mateus/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - cmsmes@escelsanet.com.br
- 35- FASE/ES - Federação de Órgãos p/ Assistência Social e Educacional (Federation of Social and Educational Organizations/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - fasees@terra.com.br
- 36- Federação Sindical e Democrática dos Trabalhadores nas Indústrias Metalúrgicas, Mecânicas e de Material Elétrico do Estado de Minas Gerais e, seus Sindicatos dos Trabalhadores Metalúrgicos filiados das cidades de (Trade Union and Democratic Federation of Workers in Metal, Mechanic and Electric materials Industries of the State of Minas Gerais and the metal trade unions that are member of this federations of the towns that follow/Minas Gerais/Brazil): Alfenas, Araxá, Betim, Belo Horizonte e Contagem, Caeté, Cambuí, Divinópolis, Extrema, Governador Valadares, Itajubá, Itaúna, João Monlevade, Juiz de Fora, Lavras, Ouro Preto, Patos de Minas, Pirapora, Pouso Alegre, Raul Soares, Sabará, Santa Luzia, Timóteo, Várzea da Palma, Vespasiano, Varginha, Três Marias, e São João Del Rei. - fsdmg@pib.com.br
- 37- Fernando Avelino - Instituto Terra Azul (institute Terra Azul/Brazil) - favelino@secret.com.br
- 38- Fernando Soares - PROJETO LEGAL - Organização de Direitos Humanos (Human Rights Organization/Rio de Janeiro/Brazil) comunicacao@projetolegal.org.br/
- 39- Flora Brasil - Porto Seguro/Bahia (Flora Brasil Porto Seguro/Bahia/Brazil)- manona@sulbanet.com.br
- 40- Flora Brasil - Santa Cruz Cabralia/Bahia (Flora Brasil Santa Cruz Cabralia/Bahia/ Brazil) - florabrasil@pradonet.com.br
- 41- Fórum Estadual de Mulheres/ES (State Forum of Women/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - gilsahb@terra.com.br
- 42- Guilherme Menezes - Deputado Federal/BA - dep.guilhermemenezes@camara.gov.br
- 43- Igreja de Confissão Luterana/Brazil - Sínodo do Espírito Santo a Belém - (Lutherian Church-Synod of Espírito Santo a Belém/Brazil) - fam.schubert@uol.com.br
- 44- Joana Tolentino - auxiliar de pesquisa CNPq/IPPUR-UFRJ.(Researcher's assistant) - joanatotentino@hotmail.com
- 45- João Batista da Silva - APEDEMA/AGB-Rio - joabatistajobit@yahoo.com.br
- 46- João Batista de Almeida Costa - antropólogo (anthropologist/Brasília/Brazil) - joba@unb.br
- 47- João José Barbosa Sana - Diretor SEEB/ES-CUT- Prof. Faculdade de Filosofia, Ciências e Letras de Alegre-ES (tradeunion director and professor/ Espírito Santo/ Brazil)- jjsana@guacui.com.br
- 48- Jorge Luiz B. Ferreira - AGB-RJ (Brazilian Association of Geographers/Rio de Janeiro/Brazil) jb.borges@ajato.com.br
- 49- Juliana Malerba - FASE-Nacional/Projeto Justiça Ambiental (project environmental justice/Rio de Janeiro/Brazil) brsust@fase.org.br
- 50- Koinonia/RJ - Presença Ecumênica e Serviço (Koinonia/Ecuminic and Service Presence/Rio de Janeiro/Brazil)- koinonia@koinonia.org.br
- 51- Maria Diana de Oliveira - AGB (Brazilian Association of Geographers/Minas Gerais/Brazil) - maria2@brfree.com.br
- 52- Maria Helena Batista Murta - Instituto Criança Viva – Fundadora (Institute Child Alife/Brazil) – mariahelenamurta@uol.com.br
- 53- Movimento de Desenvolvimento Rural de Nestor Gomes/São Mateus - Paulo Chagas (Movement of Rural Development Nestor Gomes/Espírito Santo/ Brazil) - tel. +55 27 99312546
- 54- MPA- Movimento dos Pequenos Agricultores (Movement of Small Peasants/ Espírito Santo/Brazil) - strsgp@sgpnet.com.br
- 55- MST/ES - Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra/Espírito Santo (Movement of Landless Peasants/Espírito Santo/Brazil)– mst-es@escelsa.com.br
- 57- MST/RJ - Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra/Rio de Janeiro (Movement of Landless Peasants/Rio de Janeiro/Brazil) mstrio@datatri.com.br
- 58- Múcio Tosta Gonçalves - Professor UFMG/Minas Gerais (university professor/ Minas Gerais/Brazil) - muciotg@netscape.net
- 59- Nahyda Franca - IBASE/RJ (member of IBASE/Rio de Janeiro/Brazil) - nahyda@ibase.br
- 60- Pastoral Operária Arquidiocese de Vitória - Luzineide R.F. Pinto (Church assistance for Workers - Archdiocese of Vitória/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - zena.po@bol.com.br
- 61- Paulo César Scarim - Geógrafo (Geographer/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - pscarim@hotmail.com
- 62- Recuper Lixo - Joel Fanticelli - Associação de Catadores de Materiais Recicláveis (Association of Workers in Recycling of Materials/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - cddh@terra.com.br
- 63- Rede Brasileira de Justiça Ambiental - Rede Brasileira de Justiça Ambiental (Brazilian Network for Environmental Justice/Brazil)- Justicaambiental@comunicante.rits.org.br
- 64- Robson Malacarne – Pastoral da Juventude de Cariacica/ES (youth church social service of Cariacica/Espírito Santo/Brazil)- Robson@belmax.com.br
- 65- Sebastião Ribeiro - Advogado Ambientalista (environmental lawyer/Espírito Santo/Brazil)- sefil@uol.com.br
- 66- Sérgio Ricardo - membro Secretaria Nacional Meio Ambiente e Desenvolvimento do PT (member of National Secretary of Environment and Development of Workers Party/Brazil) - srverde@uol.com.br
- 67- Simone Raquel Batista Ferreira – Geógrafa (Geographer/Espírito Santo/Brazil)- sibatista@hotmail.com
- 68- Sindicato dos Bancários Extremo Sul da Bahia (Trade Union of Bank Employees/ Bahia/Brazil) - sindexrsul@dstech.com.br
- 69- Sindicato dos Petroleiros/Espírito Santo (Trade Union of Oil Industry Workers/ Espírito Santo/Brazil) - sindipetro-es@uol.com.br
- 70- Sindicato dos Trabalhadores Rurais de São Gabriel da Palha e Vila Valério (Rural Workers Trade Union of São Gabriel da Palha and Vila Valério/ Espírito Santo/Brazil) - strsgp@sgpnet.com.br
- 71- Sindicato dos Trabalhadores Rurais de Medina - Márcio Pereira - (Rural Workers Trade Union of Medina/Minas Gerais/Brazil) - strmed@ligbr.com.br
- 72- Sindicato dos Trabalhadores Rurais de São Mateus e Jaguaré (Rural Workers Trade Union of São Mateus and Jaguaré/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - straomateus@terra.com.br

- 73- Sindicato dos Trabalhadores Rurais de Unai (Rural Workers Trade Union of Unai/ Minas Gerais/Brazil) - marmiran@bol.com.br
- 74- Super Coonfex - Marilene Ost Leal - Cooperativa de Confecção de José de Anchieta (cooperative of workers with textile/Serra/Brazil) - cddh@terra.com.br
- 75- Temístocles Marcelo Neto - Coordenador Comissão Nacional de Meio Ambiente da CUT Nacional (Co-ordinator National Environmental Comission of the CUT – central trade unions federation of Brazil/São Paulo/Brazil) - temistocles@cut.org.br
- 76- Terra Viva - Itamarajú/Bahia (organization for agro-ecology/Bahia/Brazil)- terraviva@dstech.com.br
- 77- Valdemar Moraes - vereador PSC/São Mateus (town-councillor São Mateus/Espírito Santo/Brazil) - cmsmes@escelsanet.com.br